

Remarks

Claims 10 and 11 are canceled.

Claims 1, 8, 12, 13, 25 and 26 are amended.

Claims 1-9 and 12-26 are now pending.

Claims 25 and 26 are withdrawn.

Claims 1-9 and 12-24 are under consideration.

Claims 1, 25 and 26 are amended to require that the alkylsulfonic acid salts are limited to those of original claim 11.

The claims are otherwise amended to remove occurrences of the term "the" to overcome antecedent basis problems.

No new matter is added.

Withdrawn claims 25 and 26 are amended to be consistent with claim 1. The Examiner is kindly requested to consider rejoining claims 25 and 26 upon finding claim 1 allowable.

Applicants note with appreciation that claim 19 is objected to as being dependent upon a rejected base claim, but is otherwise allowable.

Claims 1, 8 and 12-13 are rejected under 35 USC 112, second paragraph, for reasons of record.

These claims are repaired by amendment as discussed above.

Applicants submit that the 35 USC 112, second paragraph rejections are addressed and are overcome.

Claims 1, 2, 9, 10, 12, 13 and 20 are rejected under 35 USC 102(b) as being anticipated by Hilti, et al., U.S. Pat. No. 5,965,206.

Claims 3 and 6-8 are rejected under 35 USC 102(b) as being anticipated by Hilti and Ueda, et al., EP 613919 (eq. to U.S. 5,604,284).

Claims 1, 3, 6-9 and 20-24 are rejected under 35 USC 102(b) as being anticipated by Ueda, et al., U.S. Pat. No. 5,604,284.

Claims 1, 2, 9 and 20-24 are rejected under 35 USC 102(b) as being anticipated by Inoue, et al., JP 05148768.

Claims 1-3, 6-9 and 20-24 are rejected under 35 USC 102(b) as being anticipated by Kamiyama, et al., U.S. Pat. No. 6,162,545.

The present claims are amended to include the limitations of original claim 11.

Thus, these 35 USC 102(b) rejections are addressed and are overcome.

Claims 1, 9-13, 15-18, 20 and 23-24 are rejected under 35 USC 102(e) as being anticipated by Iwasa, et al., published U.S. app. No. 2003/0072935.

Applicants respectfully rebut these rejections.

Iwasa teaches a porous resin film containing thermoplastic resin, an inorganic and/or organic finely divided powder and a hydrophilicizer (Abstract).

The hydrophilicizer may be dodecanesulfonic acid sodium salt (paragraph [0071]) or may be lauryl diethanolamine (paragraph [0072]). These disclosures are somewhat generic.

Paragraph [0079] states that "The porous resin film...may comprise a hydrophilic resin incorporated therein as an arbitrary additional component in addition to the aforementioned components..." The hydrophilic resin may be those as disclosed in paragraph [0081]. This is a long list within which is mentioned polyether ester amide.

Applicants submit that those skilled in the art could not have arrived at the present invention from this very broad and generic disclosure of Iwasa. The listing of dodecanesulfonic acid sodium salt and diethanolamide are somewhat generic, the listing of polyether ester amide is optional and is very broad and generic.

Applicants submit that these 35 USC 102(e) rejections are addressed and are overcome.

Claims 4-5 are rejected under 35 USC 103(a) as being unpatentable over Hilti in view of Kamiyama.

Claims 4-5 are rejected under 35 USC 103(a) as being obvious over Kamiyama.

Claims 6-8 are rejected under 35 USC 103(a) as being obvious over Hilti in view of Ueda (EP '919).

These rejections are addressed and are obviated in view of the present amendments.

Claims 11 and 14 are rejected under 35 USC 103(a) as being unpatentable over Hilti.

Applicants respectfully rebut these rejections.

The inorganic or low molecular weight organic salt (b3) of Hilti is disclosed in col. 7, lines 29-36. Low molecular weight organic protonic acids are for example those of from 1 to 4 carbon atoms. Alternatively, the present acid salt specifically contains from 10 to 18 carbon atoms.

The limitations of the present claims are not met by Hilti.

Further, it is not obvious to substitute long chain alkylsulfonates for short chain alkylsulfonates. There can be no expectation of success. The success of the present invention is demonstrated in the working Example on pages 29-32 of the disclosure. The outstanding success of the present invention certainly could not have been expected from the disclosure of Hilti.

Claims 10-14 are rejected under 35 USC 103(a) as being unpatentable over Ueda, et al., U.S. Pat. No. 5,604,284 (*sic*) in view of Kido, et al., U.S. Pat. No. 5,849,822.

That the primary reference is Ueda '284 was confirmed in a telephone call with Examiner Vijayakumar on March 6, 2007.

Applicants respectfully rebut these rejections.

The sulfonic acid salt group of Kido of col. 6, lines 35-51 is part of the polyether ester disclosed therein. There is no overlap here with the present component ii). Kido does generically disclose alkylsulfonic acid salts, alkylbenzenesulfonic acid salts or alkylnaphthalenesulfonic acid salts, col. 12, lines 31-34. An aromatic containing salt is particularly preferred, col. 12, lines 35-44. Sodium dodecylsulfonate is disclosed in col. 12, lines 55-56.

From the combined disclosure of Ueda and Kido, the skilled artisan would not be motivated to arrive at the present invention where the migratory additive is a C₁₀-C₁₈alkylsulfonic acid salt. One might have been motivated to employ an alkyl-aromatic sulfonic acid salt. In any event, the outstanding success of the present invention could not have been expected from the combined disclosures of Ueda and Kido. The Examiner is again directed to the present working Examples.

In view of the present amendments and the above remarks, Applicants submit that each of the 35 USC 112, second paragraph, 35 USC 102(b), 35 USC 102(e) and 35 USC 103(a) rejections are addressed and are overcome.

The Examiner is kindly requested to reconsider and to withdraw the present rejections.

Applicants submit that the present claims are now in condition for allowance and respectfully request that they be found allowable.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Tyler A. Stevenson', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Tyler A. Stevenson
Agent for Applicants
Reg. No. 46,388

Ciba Specialty Chemicals Corp.
540 White Plains Road
P.O. Box 2005
Tarrytown, NY 10591-9005
Tel. (914)785-2783
Fax (914)785-7102

April 24, 2007